



2019

Ofelia García and the CUNY-NYSIEB Community: Symbiosis in Furthering Translanguaging Pedagogy and Practice

Maite T. Sánchez
Hunter College, City of New York

Kate Menken
Queens College, City College of New York

Follow this and additional works at: <https://fordham.bepress.com/jmer>



Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Sánchez, Maite T. and Menken, Kate (2019) "Ofelia García and the CUNY-NYSIEB Community: Symbiosis in Furthering Translanguaging Pedagogy and Practice," *Journal of Multilingual Education Research: Vol. 9*, Article 12.

Available at: <https://fordham.bepress.com/jmer/vol9/iss1/12>

This Ofelia García as a Mentor is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalResearch@Fordham. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Multilingual Education Research by an authorized editor of DigitalResearch@Fordham. For more information, please contact considine@fordham.edu, bkilee@fordham.edu.



Ofelia García and the CUNY-NYSIEB Community: Symbiosis in Furthering Translanguaging Pedagogy and Practice

Cover Page Footnote

Maite T. Sanchez, PhD, is an Assistant Professor of Bilingual Education at Hunter College of the City University of New York. She is also a Project Advisor for CUNY-NYSIEB, (CUNY-New York State Initiative for Emergent Bilinguals). She holds a PhD in education from Boston College. Her research focuses on language education policy and practice, bilingual education, translanguaging pedagogy, and bilingual education teacher preparation. Her latest publication (with O. García and C. Solorza) is Reframing language allocation in dual language bilingual education (Bilingual Research Journal). Further information can be found on her website: <http://www.maitesanchez.org>

Kate Menken, PhD, is a Professor of Linguistics at Queens College of the City University of New York (CUNY) and a Research Fellow at the Research Institute for the Study of Language in Urban Society at the CUNY Graduate Center. Her research interests include language education policy, bilingual education, and the education of emergent bilinguals in U.S. public schools. Her books are English Learners Left Behind: Standardized Testing as Language Policy (Multilingual Matters, 2008), Negotiating Language Policies in Schools: Educators as Policymakers (co-edited with Ofelia García, Routledge, 2010), and Common Core, Bilingual and English Language Learners: A Resource for Educators (co-edited with Guadalupe Valdés and Mariana Castro, Caslon, 2015). Further information can be found on her website: <http://katemenken.org>

Ofelia García and the CUNY-NYSIEB Community: Symbiosis in Furthering Translanguaging Pedagogy and Practice

Maite T. Sánchez

Hunter College, City of New York

Kate Menken

Queens College, City College of New York

Ofelia García's scholarship on dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging has been at the core of CUNY-NYSIEB. At the same time, CUNY-NYSIEB's work in schools has furthered her own scholarship on translanguaging pedagogy and that of the field as a whole. It is this rich symbiosis that we describe in this article.

Keywords: advocate, CUNY-NYSIEB, disrupt, dynamic bilingualism, inspire, Ofelia García, scholarship, symbiosis, translanguaging pedagogy and practice

In her seminal 2009 book, *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective*, Ofelia García, building on the work of Williams (1994), put forth the term translanguaging to encompass the fluid languaging practices of bilinguals, particularly emergent bilinguals in school contexts. Soon after this book's publication, in 2011, leaders at the New York State Education Department (NYSED) approached Ofelia García and her former student and then colleague and one of the authors of this article, Kate Menken, offering to fund a professional development project for schools in New York serving high percentages of emergent bilinguals. Ricardo Otheguy, Ofelia García, and Kate Menken saw this as an opportunity to support schools in their efforts to improve the programming and practices they provide to bilingual students, and to work in partnership with educators to develop translanguaging pedagogy, which at the time was in its infancy (as noted by Canagarajah, 2011). In part, they wanted to study how school leaders engage in this pedagogy and whether doing so would change their understandings about bilingualism and their language minoritized students, thereby transforming educational practices. This is how the City University of New York – New York State Initiative on Emergent Bilinguals (CUNY-NYSIEB) was born.

Ofelia García's scholarship on dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging has been at the core of CUNY-NYSIEB. At the same time, CUNY-NYSIEB's work in schools has furthered her own scholarship on translanguaging pedagogy and that of the field as

a whole. It is this rich symbiosis that we describe in this article. We open the discussion with a brief overview of Ofelia García's scholarship on translanguaging and consider the role of CUNY-NYSIEB in developing that work. We then describe the CUNY-NYSIEB project, including its vision, design, and structures with enough detail to support those engaged in similar efforts elsewhere. Further, we present an analysis of reflections by members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Community (team members and state, district, and school leaders who have worked closely with CUNY-NYSIEB for several years), which document the enormous influence of Ofelia García on their work. We also describe the collaborative and dialogic nature of CUNY-NYSIEB, and its significance in fostering growth and change. Ofelia García has greatly impacted the CUNY-NYSIEB Community and far beyond. At the same time, through CUNY-NYSIEB work, her scholarship on translanguaging and translanguaging pedagogy has flourished.

CUNY-NYSIEB and Ofelia García's Scholarship on Translanguaging Pedagogy

In her 2009 book, Ofelia García joined other scholars of sociolinguistics and applied linguistics in their protests against traditional, fixed language categories (e.g., Blommaert, 2010; Jacquemet, 2005; Makoni & Pennycook, 2007), and expanded Cen Williams' (1994) concept of translanguaging. This construct was rooted in his research with colleagues about the use of both Welsh and English within a single lesson in a classroom, and specifically referred to input in one language with output in another. Centered on the bilingual speaker's point of view, García (2009) defined translanguaging as "the multiple discursive practices in which bilinguals engage in order to make sense of their bilingual world" (p. 45) or "the deployment of a speaker's full linguistic repertoire" (Otheguy, García, & Reid, 2015, p. 281).

When CUNY-NYSIEB began in 2011, translanguaging pedagogy was still a new area of research and practice (Canagarajah, 2011). At that time, Dr. García and other scholars started to highlight the language practices of emergent bilinguals and consider ways to incorporate these practices in their schooling (see for instance Blackledge & Creese, 2010; Canagarajah, 2011; Hornberger & Link, 2012; Wei, 2011). Ofelia García and Jo Anne Kleifgen defined translanguaging pedagogy as "all practices that work against the bracketing of English, building instead English proficiency using the home language as a scaffold" (García & Kleifgen, 2010; 2018, p. 63). In the early stages of the CUNY-NYSIEB project, team members developed two translanguaging guides for teachers laying out translanguaging pedagogy (Celice & Seltzer, 2012; Hesson, Seltzer, & Woodley, 2014), each of which included a description of translanguaging and its pedagogical implications written by Ofelia García.

By 2014, her writing on translanguaging was very productive with approximately 21 publications by her alone or with colleagues (<http://www.ofeliagarcia.org>). She and Li Wei (2014) published their book, *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education*, which provided the conceptual basis for translanguaging theory and pedagogy, and the second section of the book is about translanguaging in classrooms. The authors described the CUNY-NYSIEB project at the time as an example of "innovative spaces" (García & Wei, 2014, p. 125) where translanguaging pedagogy was being developed.

Much of the research about translanguaging pedagogy in the field to date has come from the CUNY-NYSIEB project, and was written by Ofelia García with members of the project team, or by project team members independently, contributing greatly to developments in this area (see for instance Ascenzi-Moreno & Espinosa, 2018; Espinet, Collins, & Ebe, 2018; García & Menken, 2015; García & Sánchez, 2015, 2018; García & Seltzer, 2016; García, Seltzer, & Witt, 2018; García, Flores, & Woodley, 2012; Menken & Sánchez, 2019). By late 2016, two books specifically on translanguaging pedagogy had been published by Ofelia García and members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Team (García, Ibarra Johnson, & Seltzer, 2016; García & Kleyn, 2016). At the same time, there has been increased interest in translanguaging pedagogy by other scholars and educational practitioners both in the U.S. and international contexts (Blackledge & Creese, 2014; Cenoz & Gorter, 2015; Gort, 2017; Paulsrud, Rosén, Straszer, & Wedin, 2017). As explained above, Ofelia García's scholarship and the work of CUNY-NYSIEB have been essential in furthering this area of inquiry.

CUNY-NYSIEB's Vision and Design

Having briefly described the literature on translanguaging and translanguaging pedagogy, with attention to Ofelia García's scholarship and the work of CUNY-NYSIEB, in this section we describe the project's vision and design. CUNY-NYSIEB is a professional development and resource development project funded by the New York State Education Department (NYSED) that began in 2011. The project's Leadership Component involves professional development about dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging for schools across New York State. The Materials Development Component involves the creation and dissemination of videos, web content, and other resources to support educators in understanding their emergent bilingual students and adopting practices that support dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging.

Ricardo Otheguy, Ofelia García, and Kate Menken served as the principal investigators (PIs) of the project and established CUNY-NYSIEB's vision and principles, based on Ofelia García's scholarship about translanguaging and dynamic bilingualism. Accordingly, the CUNY-NYSIEB vision can be summarized as follows:

- **Emergence:** Language practices of students are always in creative emergence, continuous, never-ending, and shaped by relationships with people, texts, and situations (García, 2009). The project uses in its name the term "emergent bilinguals" (García, Kleifgen, & Falchi, 2008) and conceptualizes diverse students as much more than learners of English only, since they are developing proficiency and literacy in academic registers of English from the base of home language practices.
- **Dynamic bilingualism:** Bilingualism is considered dynamic and not merely additive (García, 2009; García & Kleifgen, 2018). Bilinguals translanguage, or use their full linguistic repertoire in order to make meaning (García, 2009; Otheguy, García, & Reid, 2015, 2018). Translanguaging is the discursive norm of all bilinguals as well as a pedagogy that not only serves as a scaffold for new language practices but transforms power relationships among named languages (García & Kleyn, 2016; Sánchez, García, & Solorza, 2018).

The following two non-negotiable principles for schools that participate in CUNY-NYSIEB were established:

1. The dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging practices of students and educators are to be celebrated, leveraged, and extended in instruction through translanguaging pedagogy.
2. Schools are to develop a schoolwide ecology of multilingualism, which reflects and displays the cultural and linguistic backgrounds of all students, their families, and their communities throughout their linguistic landscape. (The CUNY-NYSIEB vision and principles can be read in their entirety online at <https://www.cuny-nysieb.org/our-vision/>)

Ofelia García was interested in CUNY-NYSIEB not only impacting New York's public schools but also its public universities. Because bilingual education has been repressed in recent history, with many programs dismantled in New York schools (Menken & Solorza, 2014), she often discussed the age disparity between herself and the next wave of bilingual education faculty within the City University of New York (CUNY), and the importance of cultivating bilingual education leadership. Therefore, the Co-PIs invited faculty members from bilingual education programs across CUNY campuses (e.g., Brooklyn College, City College, Hunter College, Lehman College, and Queens College) to serve as Associate Investigators. In later years, faculty members from the State University of New York (SUNY) also participated. CUNY Graduate Center doctoral students, most of whom had been teachers, joined the team as Research Assistants, and several veteran teachers or staff developers became project Specialists. Nelson Flores served as the Interim Project Director during its first year, and then Maite Sánchez assumed the directorship from 2012 to 2017. Maite was followed by Kate Seltzer (2017-2018) and Ivana Espinet (2018-present), both of whom had previously been Research Assistants. A total of nine Associate Investigators (AIs), eleven Research Assistants (RAs), and two Field Associates have participated in the CUNY-NYSIEB team working with schools, with approximately fourteen participating each year in addition to the Project Director, PI, and Co-PIs.¹

The CUNY-NYSIEB Leadership Component

The CUNY-NYSIEB Leadership Component worked intensively with four cohorts of schools, providing professional development to 69 schools in New York State from 2012 through 2015. All of the schools applied to participate in CUNY-NYSIEB. These schools had different grade spans, and offered transitional bilingual, dual language, and/or English as a New Language (ENL) programs. The CUNY-NYSIEB Leadership Component provided participating schools with professional development for 1-1.5 years and multilingual classroom libraries. Schools engaged in three structures in order to enact the two CUNY-NYSIEB non-negotiable principles in their work: Leadership Seminars, Support Team Visits, and Emergent Bilingual Leadership Teams.

Leadership Seminars

Each cohort participated together in day-long professional development seminars, called Leadership Seminars, in which each school sent their principal (and/or

assistant principals) and at least two or three teachers. During the first semester, the Leadership Seminars met monthly and during the second semester met every 2.5 months. Each Leadership Seminar included workshops lead by Ofelia García and other CUNY-NYSIEB team members on dynamic bilingualism, multilingual ecology, and translanguaging pedagogy. Schools, also, participated in Collaborative Descriptive Inquiry (CDI) groups following the process developed by Patricia Carini (2000); for more detail, see García & Traugh, 2002) to offer a collaborative, democratic space in which participants had the opportunity to reflect on seminar content and its applications.

Emergent Bilingual Leadership Team (EBLT)

Each CUNY-NYSIEB school was also required to form an Emergent Bilingual Leadership Team (EBLT), comprised of 4-7 members including the principal, other key administrators or support personnel, bilingual, and/or ENL teachers, and general education teachers. The EBLT's responsibility was to study the school's emergent bilinguals and the structures in place to serve them, create an action plan aligned to CUNY-NYSIEB's principles to improve instruction and programming, and oversee implementation of this plan. EBLTs were supported in their work through the Leadership Seminars and by the CUNY-NYSIEB Support Teams.

Support Team Visits

Throughout their enrollment in the Leadership Component, each participating school received monthly visits from a CUNY-NYSIEB Support Team consisting of an Associate Investigator or Specialist and a Research Assistant. Ofelia García frequently joined these visits. The visits included meetings with the EBLT to guide and support their work, the provision of professional development on translanguaging and dynamic bilingualism to school staff, and partnerships with individual teachers to support their implementation of translanguaging pedagogy. The work of the Support Team was tailored to the specific needs of each school according to their action plan.

In order to sustain the engagement of CUNY-NYSIEB schools once their formal enrollment in the Leadership Component ended, school staff continued to attend Leadership Seminars once per semester and maintained relationships with Team members for research and continued work on educational practices. Teachers were also invited to serve as CUNY-NYSIEB Ambassadors, who model translanguaging pedagogy for other educators and whose work is featured in CUNY-NYSIEB videos, instructional resources, and publications.

Collaboration within the CUNY-NYSIEB Team

Together, CUNY-NYSIEB team members (Co-Principal Investigators, Project Directors, Associate Investigators, and Research Assistants) developed and deepened our individual understandings of translanguaging and translanguaging pedagogy over the years since the project's inception, and continue to do so. The CUNY-NYSIEB team is large, and taking up translanguaging theory and a translanguaging stance challenged and unsettled many of our previous understandings about bilingualism and bilingual learning. Therefore, extensive dialogue and collaboration were central in the process. Towards that end, the Co-Principal Investigators and the Project Director met bi-weekly

in the first four years of CUNY-NYSIEB, and the entire team met monthly to share the work of each school and discuss schools' efforts to implement translanguaging pedagogy.

CUNY-NYSIEB team members also participated in CDIs around essential questions about theory or practice, such as “How does translanguaging pedagogy look when the teacher doesn't speak the languages of their students?” or “How can translanguaging pedagogy be implemented in dual language bilingual education if traditionally there is an expectation of language separation?” The team discussed what they saw in CUNY-NYSIEB schools, including examples of pedagogy that they observed or developed with participating teachers.

Through this collaborative process, a strong sense of community developed amongst the team over time – a point documented in the findings presented below. Different types of writing opportunities arose. For example, some team members wrote CUNY-NYSIEB guides that were used in schools but also shared widely (Celic & Seltzer, 2011; Hesson, Seltzer, & Woodley, 2014; Pérez Rosario, 2015; Espinosa, Ascenzi-Moreno, & Vogel, 2016). Team members have presented alongside the Co-PIs and Project Director at Leadership Seminars and in local, national, and international conferences. They have also co-authored with Ofelia García, solo authored, or co-authored with other team members publications that have come from the work of CUNY-NYSIEB. Likewise, the collaboration between CUNY-NYSIEB Support Teams and participating educators often moved beyond their classrooms, resulting in presenting together at local and national conferences, and co-authoring publications (see for instance García & Kleyn, 2016). Their classroom work is featured in videos (<https://www.cuny-nysieb.org/classroom-videos/>) and other resources on the CUNY-NYSIEB website (<https://www.cuny-nysieb.org>). Through this process, Ofelia García and the team supported CUNY-NYSIEB schools and contributed to understandings about translanguaging and translanguaging pedagogy more widely.

Reflection Inquiry

Through the work of CUNY-NYSIEB, many people have engaged with Ofelia García's scholarship or with her personally. For the purposes of this JMER Special Issue, we conducted qualitative research (Creswell, 2013; Stake, 1995) to answer the following research question: *What are the perceptions of members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Community regarding how Ofelia García has influenced them professionally and personally?* Participants in this research included: (a) all Team members (defined as Associate Investigators and Research Assistants) who have worked on the Leadership Component since 2012; (b) state-level administrators; and, (c) district and school-based leaders of schools who have been actively involved in CUNY-NYSIEB for at least two years. We sent each person an open-ended questionnaire asking them to reflect on one or more of the following questions:

- *In what ways has the work of Ofelia García impacted you professionally?*
 - *Specifically, are there ways that Ofelia's work has caused you to change what you do and how you think about the education of emergent bilinguals?*
- *In what way(s) has Ofelia impacted you personally?*

- *Is there anything else about Ofelia García that you would like people to know about her?*

A total of 36 members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Community responded, comprising an 85.1% response rate (see Table 1 for details).

Table 1

Research Participants

CUNY-NYSIEB Member Category	Invited n= 42	Responded n= 36
Team members	22	20
State officials	3	2
District and school leaders	17	14
Total	42	36

We collected all the reflections and analyzed them as per the guidance of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2013) and Saldaña (2015), involving first and second level coding to identify key themes and draw comparisons. Table 2 includes the codes and

corresponding themes that emerged from our data analysis.

Table 2

Data Analysis: Codes and Themes

Codes	Themes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How a dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging framework challenge traditional ideas in the field • How a dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging framework challenge personal ideas about bilingualism and working with bilingual students 	Be Critical and Challenge Established Ideas (“Disrupt!”)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Changes in district-level supports for emergent bilinguals to highlight their multilingualism • Changes in classroom practices through translanguaging pedagogy • Changes in university-level courses to reflect dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging pedagogy 	Act in Support of Bilingual Students and their Communities, (“Advocate!”)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inspiration for advocacy in professional settings • Inspiration for relationship building and nurturing 	Be an inspiration (“Inspire”)

Findings: Ofelia García's Legacy through the CUNY-NYSIEB Community

The following three themes emerged from CUNY-NYSIEB Community members' reflections about Ofelia García's personal and professional influence: (1) be critical and challenge established ideas (Disrupt!); (2) act in support of bilingual students and their communities (Advocate!); and (3) be an inspiration (Inspire!). Our findings show the enormous impact that Ofelia García has had on our thinking, shaping our research and practices for years to come. Each theme is discussed below in detail supported by quotes of informants.²

Be Critical and Challenge Established Ideas ("Disrupt!")

In their reflections, a central focus of CUNY-NYSIEB team members and district- and school-based leaders was on the influence of Ofelia García's scholarship over the past decade about dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging (e.g., García, 2009; García & Wei, 2014; Otheguy, García, & Reid, 2015; 2018). Specifically, CUNY-NYSIEB team members and district- and school-based leaders stated that her ideas are unapologetic, and push us all not to simply accept traditional approaches, but rather to view these critically and, when needed, to *disrupt*. They understood how her scholarship reframes bilingualism from static views of first and second language to dynamic bilingual development (García, 2009; García & Wei, 2014). Likewise, they described how her work challenges traditional program models that are organized solely around named languages to focus on the actual language practices of bilingual students (e.g., García, 2009; García, Menken, Velasco, & Vogel, 2018; Sánchez, García, & Solorza, 2018). They also reflected on how that scholarship has helped them to "re-articulate", "reframe," "challenge," and/or "re-shape" their own understandings of bilingualism and the education of emergent bilinguals. For example, an Associate Investigator described how her views of bilinguals and bilingualism changed as she engaged with Ofelia García's scholarship and worked with CUNY-NYSIEB.

This work [CUNY NYSIEB] that Ofelia and her colleagues had created was transformative. From day one it challenged understandings about bilingualism I had held for many years. Through translanguaging, Ofelia invited us to view bilinguals (and multilinguals) with new eyes. I learned, for example, that it is only from the outsider's view that we can consider that bilinguals have two named languages. From the bilingual person's perspective (insider's view), bilinguals have one linguistic repertoire. These new insights forced me to rethink and question how I was positioning the bilingual child and teacher in my pedagogy as a teacher educator. (Associate Investigator)

A Research Assistant who worked as a bilingual education teacher, before starting her doctoral studies at the CUNY Graduate Center, commented on how the framework that translanguaging provides was fundamental in understanding her uneasiness with strict language separation in her school's dual language bilingual program.

Before working with Ofelia and joining CUNY-NYSIEB I was always under the impression that keeping languages separate was the sign of a "good" bilingual. However, this never felt true, but I lacked the language and understanding to

explain that feeling. Learning about translanguaging and joining CUNY-NYSIEB changed not only the way I viewed bilingual language skills but also the way I understood language. Language was no longer just a communication tool, it was a function of identity, it was a medium for learning and for building community.
(Research Assistant)

Similarly, district and school leaders mentioned how Ofelia García's work contests entrenched ideas about the schooling of emergent bilingual students that privilege English learning at the expense of their students' bilingual development. The two quotes below, from a district administrator and a principal exemplify something we heard repeatedly from district and school leaders: how the term 'translanguaging' offered a name for language practices in which they engaged every day, and offered them the permission that they needed to do so.

When I went to the first [CUNY-NYSIEB] training it was a breath of fresh air. I felt like a dark shadow had been lifted and her words gave legitimacy to something I had known at the beginning of my career in bilingual education, something I knew in my gut was right, but something that had been long buried and forgotten - the dynamic nature of bilingualism and the concept of translanguaging. (District Administrator)

I remember Dr. García's first presentation when we joined CUNY-NYSIEB. I remember saying, "These are the words I have been looking for...this makes so much sense!" All of the so-called 'models' and focus on 'compliance' leave out the element which was so sincere and of which Dr. García speaks so eloquently. We want to celebrate students' home language because then we are celebrating the child and their family and their culture. (Principal)

For educators, having exposure to the work of Ofelia García also helped them understand their own translanguaging practices. Many translanguaged in their classrooms in order to respond to their students' needs, but then felt guilty because doing so broke language separation guidelines or expectations. In the following excerpt, an ENL teacher reflected on this:

When I first heard Ofelia speak about the concept of translanguaging, it was as if the pieces of a puzzle were put together. As a teacher of emergent bilinguals, I realized that in many ways I had been using - or facilitated students' using - multiple languages to improve their learning in the classroom. I just hadn't seen the big picture of how these strategies all fit together under the concept of translanguaging. Once Ofelia put a name to this practice, it paved the way for all of us as educators to implement translanguaging strategies in a purposeful way.
(ENL Teacher)

Taken together, the reflections of academics, educators, and administrators that form the CUNY-NYSIEB Community show how Ofelia and her work teaches the importance of disrupting ideas and institutional structures that prevail in our field and that no longer serve bilinguals.

Act in Support of Bilingual Students and their Communities, (“Advocate!”)

In this section, we present reflections from district and school administrators, teachers, and university faculty about the changes that members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Community report having implemented as a result of their engagement with Ofelia García and her scholarship through the project. Two district officials who worked closely with schools in their districts that participated in CUNY-NYSIEB commented on the changes made in those schools. One school created the district’s first Karen Heritage Language Program for refugee students as a result of their participation in CUNY-NYSIEB, and another participating CUNY-NYSIEB school adopted translanguaging pedagogy schoolwide when instruction previously had been monolingual in English. One of these district administrators, who is in charge of the office that oversees programs for emergent bilinguals, reflected on how school staff had found creative and new ways to support bilingualism for more students as result of their participation in CUNY-NYSIEB: *“The transformation from a deficit paradigm to one of acknowledgment and support of home language assets was remarkable and will have a positive impact for years to come.”*

In another district, the administrator of the office overseeing programming for emergent bilinguals reflected on how the district replaced their transitional bilingual education programs with dual language bilingual education as a means to support bilingualism and biliteracy development throughout the elementary school years.

Our work with CUNY-NYSIEB...has led our district to adopt a formal vision for our emergent bilinguals, to implement a one-way and two-way dual language program, and to abandon the transitional bilingual classes. We believe that all children should embrace and enhance their home language, while learning English.
(District Leader)

Across this district, the leader promoted an approach to bilingual education that she felt would offer more opportunities for students to engage and leverage their home language practices in schools.

Teachers who participated in CUNY-NYSIEB also described how they transformed teaching and learning in their classrooms to support their students. One bilingual education teacher started implementing translanguaging pedagogy as a result of her involvement in CUNY-NYSIEB. She reflected on how her work has been redefined through her personal interactions with Ofelia García and with her scholarship.

There are people that cross one’s professional path and make positive contributions. Others have the ability to enhance your work. Very few people have the gift to shift and redefine your professional world. Ofelia Garcia’s work through CUNY-NYSIEB has influenced hundreds of classrooms and the education of thousands of students. Through her work, I’ve been able to see my students as seeds of promise with amazing linguistic abilities. Ofelia García has taught me to lean into the unknown and have the courage to teach from a different space. A beautiful bilingual space. I’ve learned that being a bilingual teacher is very different from teaching from a bilingual space. Being a bilingual teacher places the focus on self, and teaching from a bilingual space places the focus on the students. (Bilingual Education Teacher)

Other teachers shared that because of the scholarship of Ofelia García and CUNY-NYSIEB support, they have seen changes in their own classrooms, in themselves, in their students, and in the environment of their schools. Below are quotes from two ENL teachers who work in the same school, each reflecting on changes that they have seen in their classrooms and school:

The translanguaging strategies that we learned helped our students internalize a repository of flexible strategies to perform successfully in class and on standardized exams. The culture of the school is starting to shift towards including student's home language across most classrooms...Most importantly, we underwent mindset shifts thanks to Garcia's work to embrace the stamina, inquiry, and work ethic required for continuous school improvement for a school our team envisions for our multilingual, transnational community. (ENL Teacher 1)

The language use in my classroom quickly became more fluid which, in turn, greatly benefited my relationships with students who felt free to express themselves in any and all languages. (ENL Teacher 2)

Faculty who were part of the CUNY-NYSIEB team also reported changing their teaching to place the perspectives of bilingual students and their families at the center of their work as teacher educators within their universities. Both Associate Investigators (university faculty) and Research Assistants (graduate students who taught courses at local universities) commented on how they changed their syllabi to include dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging.

My teaching has changed...I now combine translanguaging and drama, visuals, technology in my class. I see how my students shine better and understand diversity better. Planning and [making] conscious effort in including emergent bilingual students learning through their home language were new to me. (Associate Investigator)

Ofelia pushed me to rethink how all students can have a bilingual education. [In my classes, I now] use my own work with Arabic speakers, Bengali, and more to think deeply and creatively about how languages can be used in empowering ways. (Research Assistant)

The changes documented in the reflections by CUNY-NYSIEB community members about the way's Ofelia García's work has shaped their pedagogy and programming for emergent bilinguals at the K-12 and university levels suggest the lasting impact of her scholarship on future generations of students and teachers.

Be an Inspiration ("Inspire!")

One of the words that repeatedly appeared in the discourse of the reflections we received about Ofelia García was "inspiration." Specifically, state and district officials, school leaders, faculty, and doctoral students commented on how the work of Ofelia García has inspired them to be the best professionals that they can be, tireless in their support for bilingual students and communities. Below we present quotes from different stakeholders, including state officials, district leaders, teachers, and CUNY-NYSIEB team members on how Ofelia García has inspired them and others.

A New York state leader reflected on the lasting impact of Ofelia García's work through CUNY-NYSIEB on educators' practices in support of their emergent bilinguals.

Her knowledge, passion and long-term commitment to these students and their communities has inspired the pedagogues and administrators that serve them. Her career and the information she has published will impact the quality of life for many of our English Language Learners/Multilingual Learners and their families for years to come by helping provide the skills and understanding that will allow them find life-long success both in and out of the classroom. (New York State Education Department Leader)

School district leaders also described how Ofelia García's scholarship and their direct work with her have given them the knowledge to sharpen their advocacy for bilingual education and emergent bilingual students and their families. These leaders have been inspired to rethink the practices in their bilingual programs that support English hegemony. As one district administrator stated:

Ofelia's work has reaffirmed this instructional practice [translanguaging pedagogy] and encouraged me to share it with others and not be afraid to defend it as an effective tool for learning...She has inspired me to continue to advocate for bilingual education to ensure equity for all students. (District Leader)

At schools, CUNY-NYSIEB teachers shared the ways in which they have been inspired by Ofelia García and their involvement in the project. Specifically, an English language arts (ELA) teacher who teaches newcomer adolescents had struggled to teach her students effectively in English medium classrooms. As she noted after starting to implement translanguaging pedagogy: "I used to doubt my effectiveness working with ENL students until she [Ofelia] gave me the vehicle to navigate through the many strategies and innovative ideas" (ELA Teacher). Another bilingual education teacher mentioned how she has been inspired to communicate with others what she has learned about translanguaging pedagogy. She stated,

Ofelia's work emboldened me to come out of hiding and to use these and other strategies to ensure that students are better served. It also encouraged me to openly communicate what I learned and continue to learn through the CUNY-NYSIEB initiative with teachers, administrators, and parents. (Bilingual Education Teacher)

CUNY-NYSIEB teachers like this one spoke of deep transformations to their practices inspired by the work of Ofelia García and CUNY-NYSIEB. For instance, a dual language bilingual education teacher participated in a CUNY-NYSIEB study group on translanguaging in dual language education where they read Ofelia García's writings and were asked to design and implement lessons that disrupt the strict separation that is prevalent in dual language programs. This experience spurred this teacher to rethink her practices and have discussions with her students on what it means to be bilingual and how they can be empowered in their bilingualism. She reflected on how Ofelia García's work inspired her to question her dual language bilingual classroom and reclaim the bilingualism of her students.

Ofelia has encouraged me to disrupt marginalizing social forces and school limitations to re-imagine bilingual education in ways that value multilingual students' holistic identities and language practices. (Bilingual Education Teacher)

Members of the CUNY-NYSIEB team also spoke of how they have been inspired by Ofelia García's and her work to disrupt educational systems that marginalize and disempower emergent bilingual students and their families. In the following passage, a CUNY-NYSIEB Associate Investigator recalled what Ofelia García typically said at the CUNY-NYSIEB Team meeting each year.

Ofelia is radical. She often begins the year [of CUNY-NYSIEB Team meetings] with a challenge to break the status quo and discuss how we can institute real change. Ofelia recognizes there are many on-going problems with the current system of bilingual education and reminds us that we must disrupt. (Associate Investigator)

As mentioned earlier, in the creation of CUNY-NYSIEB, one of Ofelia García's greatest contributions to local bilingual education was to design the project in such a way that it would cultivate a community of scholars across CUNY (and SUNY) campuses, and provide mentorship for students and junior faculty. The CUNY-NYSIEB team has been a very collaborative and nurturing environment in which Associate Investigators, Research Assistants and Project Directors have worked together to encourage the scholarly work of everyone. Since CUNY-NYSIEB began, every faculty member who went up for tenure and/or promotion was successful in doing so, and every doctoral student has either defended their dissertation and graduated or are on track to do so. Also, those who wanted to pursue academic careers have been successful in finding positions. However, all team members discussed how the model for that mentorship was Ofelia García, whose leadership fostered a nurturing and collaborative atmosphere. A Research Assistant said that she showed her how to be "a warm and supportive professional colleague," and posited that part of her legacy "will absolutely be the creation of a community of scholars who not only respect one another's work but LIKE one another!" (Research Assistant). As one Associate Investigator recalled:

Ofelia takes the time to talk with each member of the community. She knows details about people's lives. She also knows where and how she can challenge each member of the community to go to the next level, to take on the next challenge. Ofelia teaches us that one never stops learning and caring. (Associate Investigator)

Ofelia García, through her scholarship and leadership of CUNY-NYSIEB, has inspired educators from state, district, school, and university settings to be confident in their ideas, voices, and the value of their work, and be tireless in building community in support for bilingual students, their families, and their home language practices.

Discussion and Conclusion

Ofelia García's scholarship on dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging has proven revolutionary for the education of emergent bilinguals. CUNY-NYSIEB started just after the publication of her groundbreaking 2009 book, at a time when translanguaging pedagogy was in its infancy, and the project has played a central role in the development of this area. As described in this paper, CUNY-NYSIEB was designed

based on Ofelia García's scholarship about dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging, which is evident in the project's vision and non-negotiable principles.

A major contribution of CUNY-NYSIEB has been the development of translanguaging pedagogy, and the collaborative structures that Ofelia García designed for the project were central in its capacity to do so. Specifically, the CUNY-NYSIEB team worked to apply her theories about dynamic bilingualism and translanguaging in classrooms, and met intensively with one another and participating schools to develop, implement, refine, and theorize translanguaging pedagogy. Ofelia García's productive scholarship on translanguaging was enriched through the work of CUNY-NYSIEB schools.

Through CUNY-NYSIEB, Ofelia García worked directly with state, district, and school leaders as well as university faculty and doctoral students from CUNY and SUNY campuses. In this paper, we explored reflections by 36 members of the CUNY-NYSIEB Community on the influence of this work, and identified three main areas of impact. First, we found that her work encourages educators, policymakers, and academics to *be critical and challenge established ideas*. She pushed the Community to not only question their own strongly held and often fossilized views about bilingualism, but also to question institutional approaches to educating bilingual students, situating them within a broader sociopolitical context and *disrupting* them when needed.

Second, respondents described how they were galvanized to *act in support of bilingual students and their communities*. Ofelia García has modeled this through her own engagement in schools and communities, ensuring that theory and practice inform one another. Finally, the reflections we received repeatedly referenced being *inspired* by Ofelia García, her scholarship, and the work of CUNY-NYSIEB to value their own voices and those of their students, and to motivate others to improve schooling for emergent bilinguals.

Ofelia García, through her leadership and scholarship, has deeply influenced the CUNY-NYSIEB Community. At the same time, the work of CUNY-NYSIEB has influenced Ofelia García's scholarship. This has proven to be a powerful symbiotic relationship. Translanguaging pedagogy is a transformative practice within schools for its capacity to place students' bilingualism at the center of decisions about programming and practice, and encourage entire schools to move from monolingual approaches in education to multilingual ones. More broadly, Ofelia García and the work of CUNY-NYSIEB has centered bilingualism in instruction and school structures, completely unsettling traditional monolingual approaches. We are only now beginning to understand the possibilities of a truly multilingual approach to schooling and the many implications of a translanguaging conceptualization of language, and expect much more research and development of educational practices in this area in years to come.

References

- Ascenzi-Moreno, L., & Espinosa, C. (2018). Opening up spaces for their whole selves: A case study group's exploration of translanguaging practices in writing. *NYS Tesol Journal*, 5(1), 10-29.
- Blackledge, A. & Creese, A. (2010). *Multilingualism: A critical perspective*. London, UK: Continuum.

- Blackledge, A., & Creese, A. (Eds.). (2014). *Heteroglossia as Practice and Pedagogy*. The Netherlands: Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-7856-6>
- Blommaert, J. (2010). *The sociolinguistics of globalization*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Canagarajah, S. (2011). Translanguaging in the classroom: Emerging issues for research and pedagogy. *Applied Linguistics Review* 2, 1–28. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CB09780511845307>
- Carini, P. (2000). Prospect's Descriptive Processes. In M. Himley & P. Carini (Eds.) *From another angle: Children's strengths and school standards* (pp. 8-20). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Celic, C., & Seltzer, K. (2012). *Translanguaging: A CUNY-NYSIEB guide for educators*. New York, NY: CUNY-NYSIEB, the Graduate Center, City University of New York. Available from: <https://www.cuny-nysieb.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Translanguaging-Guide-March-2013.pdf>
- Cenoz, J., & García, O. (Eds.). (2017). Breaking away from the multilingual solitudes in language education: International perspectives. *International Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, 16(4).
- Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (Eds.). (2015). *Multilingual education: Between language learning and translanguaging*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design. Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Espinet, I., Collins, B., & Ebe, A. (2018). "I'm multilingual": Leveraging students' translanguaging practices to strengthen the school community. In M. L. Althier & P. Ruggiano Schmidt (Eds.), *School of promise for multilingual students* (pp. 118-133). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- García, O. (2009). *Bilingual education in the 21st century. A global perspective*. Malden, MA: Wiley.
- García, O., Flores, N., & Woodley, H. (2012). Transgressing monolingualism and bilingual dualities: Translanguaging pedagogies. In A. Yiakoumetti (Ed.), *Harnessing linguistic variation to improve education* (pp. 45-75). Bern, Switzerland: Peter Lang.
- García, O., Ibarra Johnson, S., & Seltzer, K. (2016). *The translanguaging classroom: Leveraging student bilingualism for learning*. Philadelphia, PA: Caslon.
- García, O., & Kleifgen, J. (2018). *Educating emergent bilinguals: Policies, programs and practices for English learners* (2nd Ed.). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- García, O., & Kleyn, T. (Eds.). (2016). *Translanguaging with multilingual students: Learning from classroom moments*. New York, NY: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315695242>
- García, O., & Menken, K. (2015). Cultivating an ecology of multilingualism in schools: Building interindividuality of voices and ideologies. In B. Spolsky, O. Inbar, & M. Tannenbaum (Eds.), *Challenges for language education and policy: Making space for people* (pp. 95-108). New York, NY: Routledge.
- García, O., Menken, K., Velasco, P., & Vogel, S. (2018). Dual language bilingual education in New York City: A potential unfulfilled?. In B. Arias & M. Fee (Eds.), *Profiles of dual language education in the 21st Century* (pp. 38-55). CAL Series on Language Education. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781788921671-006>
- García, O., & Sánchez, M. (2015). Transforming schools with emergent bilinguals: The CUNY-NYSIEB Project. In I. Dirim, I. Gogolin, D. Knorr, M. Krüger-Potratz, D. Lengyel, H. Reich, & W. Weiße (Eds.) *Intercultural education: Festschrift for Ulla Neumann* (pp. 80-94). Berlin, Germany: Waxmann-Verlag.

- García, O., & Sánchez, M.T. (2018). Transformando la educación de bilingües emergentes en el estado de Nueva York. *Language, Education, and Multilingualism*, 1, 138-156.
- García, O. & Seltzer, K. (2016). The translanguaging current in language education. In B. Kindenberg (ed.) *Flerspråkighet som resurs* [Multilingualism as a resource]. (pp. 19-30). The Hague, The Netherlands: Liber.
- García, O., Seltzer, K., & Witt, D. (2018). Disrupting Linguistic Inequalities in US Urban Classrooms: The Role of Translanguaging . In P. Van Avermaet, S. Slembrouck, K. Van Gorp, S. Sierens, & K. Marijns. (Eds.). *The multilingual edge of education* (pp. 41-66). London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-54856-6_3
- García, O., & Traugh, C. (2002). Using descriptive inquiry to transform the education of linguistically diverse US teachers and students. In L. Wei, J.-M. Dewaele, & A. Housen, *Opportunities and challenges of bilingualism* (pp. 311-328). Berlin, Germany: Mouton de Gruyter.
- García, O., & Wei, L. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, bilingualism and education*. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan Pivot. <https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137385765>
- Gort, M. (Ed.). (2017). *The complex and dynamic languaging practices of emergent bilinguals: Translanguaging across diverse education and community contexts*. New York, NY: Taylor & Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315180052>
- Hesson, S., Seltzer, K. & Woodley, H. (2014). *Translanguaging in curriculum and instruction: A CUNY-NYSIEB guide for educators*. New York, NY: CUNY-NYSIEB, the Graduate Center, City University of New York. Available from: <https://www.cuny-nysieb.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Translanguaging-Guide-Curr-Inst-Final-December-2014.pdf>
- Hornberger, N., & Link, H. (2012). Translanguaging and transnational literacies in multilingual classrooms: A biliteracy lens. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 15(3), 261–278. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2012.658016>
- Jacquemet, M. (2005). Transidiomatic practices: Language and power in the age of globalization. *Language & Communication*, 25, 257–277. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langcom.2005.05.001>
- Li Wei. (2011). Moment analysis and translanguaging space. Discursive construction of identities by multilingual Chinese youth in Britain. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 43, 1222-1235. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2010.07.035>
- Makoni, S., & Pennycook, A. (2007). *Disinventing and reconstituting languages*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781853599255>
- Menken, K., & Sánchez, M. T, (2019) Translanguaging in English-only schools: From pedagogy to stance in the disruption of monolingual policies and practices. *TESOL Quarterly* (Early view version online). <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.513>
- Menken, K. & Solorza, C. (2014). No child left bilingual: Accountability and the elimination of bilingual education programs in New York City schools. *Educational Policy*, 28(1), 96-125. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904812468228>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2013). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Otheguy, R., García, O., & Reid, W. (2015). Clarifying translanguaging and deconstructing named languages: A perspective from linguistics. *Applied Linguistics Review*, 6(3), 281–307. <http://doi.org/10.1515/applirev-2015-0014>

- Otheguy, R., García, O., & Reid, W. (2018). A translanguaging view of the linguistic system of bilinguals. *Applied Linguistics Review*. Published online <https://doi.org/10.1515/applirev-2018-0020>
- Paulsrud, B., Rosén, J., Straszer, B., & Wedin, A, (Eds.). (2017). *New perspectives on translanguaging and education*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783097821>
- Saldaña, J. (2015). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. (3rd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Sánchez, M. T., García, O., & Solorza, C. (2018). Reframing language allocation policy in dual language bilingual education. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 41(1), 37-51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2017.1405098>
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousands Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Williams, C. (1994). Arfarniad o ddulliau dysgu ac addysgu yng nghyd-destun addysg uwchradd ddwyieithog [Evaluation of teaching and learning methods in the context of bilingual secondary education]. Bangor, Wales: University of Wales.

End Notes

¹ In addition to the PI, Co-PIs, and Project Director, the following people have been part of the Leadership Component of CUNY-NYSIEB: Associate Investigators: Laura Ascenzi-Moreno, Brian Collins, Ann Ebe, Cecilia Espinosa, Meral Kaya, Erin Kearney, Tatyana Kleyn, Dina López, Kate Mahoney, and Vanessa Pérez-Rosario. Tatyana Kleyn and Vanessa Pérez-Rosario each also served as interim Co-PI for one year. Research Assistants: Gladys Aponte, Kathryn Carpenter, María Cioè Peña, Ivana Espinet, Luis Guzmán Valerio, Luz Herrera, Sarah Hesson, Liza Pappas, Kate Seltzer, Sara Vogel, and Heather Woodley. Field Associates: Christina Celic and Cristian Solorza. Other personnel have participated in other areas of the project. For the complete listing, go to: <https://www.cuny-nysieb.org/our-team/>

²The use of Ofelia was kept in the quotes since it is how the informants referred to her in the original inquiry text.